UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN

NEIL GAIMAN, and MARVELS AND MIRACLES, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

VS.

Case No. 02-CV-048-BBC

TODD MCFARLANE, TODD MCFARLANE PRODUCTIONS, INC., TMP INTERNATIONAL, INC., MCFARLANE WORLDWIDE, INC., and IMAGE COMICS, INC.,

Madison, Wisconsin June 14, 2010

Defendants.

1:00 p.m.

STENOGRAPHIC TRANSCRIPT OF MOTION HEARING AFTERNOON SESSION HELD BEFORE THE HONORABLE BARBARA B. CRABB

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs: Foley & Lardner, LLP

BY: ALLEN ARNTSEN

JEFFREY A. SIMMONS 150 East Gilman Street Post Office Box 1497

Madison, Wisconsin 53701

Kenneth F. Levin & Associates

BY: KENNETH F. LEVIN

20 North Wacker Drive, Suite 2200

Chicago, Illinois 60606

CHERYL A. SEEMAN, RMR, CRR Official Court Reporter United States District Court 120 North Henry Street, Room 520 Madison, Wisconsin 53703 1-608-255-3821

For the Defendants: Bryan Cave, LLP

BY: JAMES ALEX GRIMSLEY
Two North Central Avenue

Suite 2200

Phoenix, Arizona 85004

Godfrey & Kahn, S.C.

BY: TODD SMITH

One East Main Street, Suite 500

P.O. Box 2719

Madison, Wisconsin 53701

* * *

I-N-D-E-X

DEFENDANTS' WITNESSES	EXAMINATION	PAGES
BRIAN HOLGUIN	Direct by Mr. Grimsley	3-21
	Cross by Mr. Arntsen	21-31
	Redirect by Mr. Grimsley	32-32
TODD MCFARLANE	Direct by Mr. Grimsley	33-65
	Cross by Mr. Arntsen	65-77
	Redirect by Mr. Grimsley	78-79
E-X-H-I-B-I-T-S		
Counsel's Stipulation Regarding Exhibits		3-3
Further Discusion Regarding Exhibits		80-84

* * *

1 THE COURT: Mr. Arntsen, then are you 2 resting? 3 MR. ARNTSEN: Yes. The only other matter is 4 the admission of exhibits. And what I propose is that 5 all of the exhibits that the witnesses are asked about just be admitted. Do you have any problem with that? 6 7 MR. GRIMSLEY: I don't have a problem with that. I actually thought we were probably going to 8 9 admit more than that even. 10 THE COURT: Sounds fine. All right. 11 MR. ARNTSEN: Okay. At least all the 12 exhibits the witnesses are asked about. 13 THE COURT: And, Mr. Grimsley, you may call 14 your first witness. 15 MR. GRIMSLEY: We call Brian Holguin. 16 BRIAN HOLGUIN, DEFENDANTS' WITNESS, SWORN 17 BY MR. GRIMSLEY: 18 Sir, could you just state your full name for the 19 record, please? 20 Yes. May name is Brian Phillip Holguin. 21 And you were a writer on the Spawn: The Dark Ages 22 series? 23 Yes, I was. I was the original writer. I would like to start off by showing you Exhibit 24

BRIAN HOLGUIN - DIRECT

Before the lunch break, Mr. Gaiman said that he

- 1 didn't recognize that character. Could you identify
- 2 that character in Exhibit 42?
- 3 A. Yes. This is Lord Covenant. He is the
- 4 protagonist, the main character, of the comic book
- 5 | Spawn: The Dark Ages.
- 6 Q. Okay. And as you understand it, that's the
- 7 character that Mr. Gaiman is continuing his derivative
- 8 of?
- 9 A. About what all this fuss is about.
- 10 MR. ARNTSEN: I will object, leading.
- 11 THE COURT: Sustained. Start again.
- 12 BY MR. GRIMSLEY:
- 13 | Q. Sure. Do you have an understanding as to what
- 14 | the importance is of Dark Ages Spawn in the context of
- 15 | this proceeding?
- 16 A. I think I do generally, yes.
- 17 \parallel Q. Okay. Can you tell me what that is?
- 18 | A. There is a dispute over whether Medieval Spawn
- 19 and the character in Spawn: The Dark Ages are
- 20 | essentially interchangeable, as I understand it.
- 21 | Q. And we previously marked Exhibit 22 as the first
- 22 | issue of Spawn: The Dark Ages. And you wrote that
- 23 | issue?
- $24 \parallel A$. Yes, I did. I believe I wrote the first 14
- 25 issues of the series.

- 1 Q. Before writing Spawn: The Dark Ages, had you
- 2 worked on other comics for Todd McFarlane Productions?
- 3 A. Yes. I had worked on a comic called
- 4 | Kiss: Psycho Circus and I worked on the original
- 5 | Spawn, the flagship title.
- 6 Q. Before working on Spawn: The Dark Ages, had you
- 7 | worked on comics for other companies?
- 8 A. Yes. I have been working in the comics industry
- 9 since 1995 or '96, I'm not quite sure.
- $10 \parallel Q$. Okay. And what are some of the other titles that
- 11 you worked on?
- 12 A. Aria, Cyberforce, Mr. Majestic, More Than Mortal.
- 13 Q. Okay. Before working as a writer, were you a
- 14 | Spawn fan?
- 15 A. I wasn't -- I was a comical fan. I wasn't
- 16 particularly a Spawn fan. I was certainly aware of
- 17 | it.
- $18 \parallel Q$. Okay. Growing up, what was your favorite comic
- 19 | book?
- 20 A. Probably Thor marvel comic book.
- 21 | Q. Now, when you say you wrote Spawn: The Dark Ages
- 22 or the first book, was it 14 issues?
- 23 | A. Mm-mm.
- $24 \parallel Q$. Does that include all of the dialogue for all the
- 25 different characters?

- A. All the dialogue, all the narration and also conceiving and constructing the plot. It's similar to -- vaguely similar to writing a film script where you are giving directions. I did final occasions -- is it day or night, indoor/outdoor, rainy/sunny, who is there, what they are wearing and what occurs as
- 7 well as writing all the dialogue bits.
- 8 Q. And you created the character Lord Covenant?
- 9 A. I would say I cocreated. Liam Sharp, who was the
- 10 | artist, certainly had a hand in creating the visual
- 11 | look. And the entire concept was obviously inspired
- 12 by Mr. McFarlane's character, Spawn.
- 13 Q. And so you and the artist created Lord Covenant
- 14 both as a Hellspawn and in his preexisting life,
- 15 correct?

2

3

4

5

- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. And you said that, I believe, it also had some
- 18 | connection to the sort of preexisting Al Simmons'
- 19 | Spawn that spurred the entire series that
- 20 Mr. McFarlane had created?
- 21 A. That's correct, yes.
- $22 \parallel Q$. Okay. Were there particular elements of the Dark
- 23 Ages Spawn character that you took from the original
- 24 || Spawn?
- $25 \parallel A$. Well, the way I would put it is concurrently with

writing Dark Ages, I was writing, as I said, the flagship title, the main Spawn book. And I believe I started around Issue 70, which is quite a few years after, you know, Issue 9, the issues you had been talking about earlier.

And one of the things I wanted to do was to expand the Spawn Universe and look at the themes that were explored in the main book and explore them further in the context of the new book, and so the character of Lord Covenant had many psychological and emotional similarities to Al Simmons as well as having differences.

- Q. What were some of the similarities?
- A. Well, Al Simmons, one of the things that intrigued me about him was the character is essentially a good man. He is a loving husband, good neighbor, but he is also a paid assassin. He is a government contract killer. And his rationale is that, well, I'm only killing the bad people. And if they didn't send me -- you know, there is a reason they are sending me after these people, and this is a reason why he is condemned to Hell and finds himself being a Hellspawn.

Similarly, Lord Covenant was a killer for what he thought was a good reason. He joined the Crusades.

- 1 He believed it was his religious duty to travel over
- 2 to the Holy Land and kill infidels. And when he dies,
- 3 there is a scene in there, and probably the most
- 4 dramatic scene in the first issue, where he is fully
- 5 expecting to go to Heaven to be rewarded for all the
- 6 people he has murdered and is somewhat shocked to find
- 7 | himself in Hell and facing the same deal that Al
- 8 | Simmons would be faced with hundreds of years later.
- $9 \parallel Q$. You have been in the courtroom all morning.
- 10 There has been some discussion about a character,
- 11 | Medieval Spawn --
- 12 | A. Mm-mm.
- 13 Q. -- I think appeared in Issue 9?
- 14 | A. Yes.
- 15 \parallel Q. Are you familiar with that character that -- we
- 16 | will call him Medieval Spawn.
- 17 \parallel A. I'm aware of that character, yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. In creating Lord Covenant and Dark Ages
- 19 | Spawn, did you draw on the character Medieval Spawn?
- 20 | A. No.
- 21 | Q. In creating Dark Ages Spawn, were you aware of
- 22 | this so-called convention that was discussed that
- 23 | there could only be one Spawn every 400 years?
- $24 \parallel A$. That, the first time I have heard that, was
- 25 | today. When I started off Spawn, Todd kind of talked

me through the rules, the rules of his universe, the rules of his creation. And I read some of the back issues and a lot of them he said, "Forget about this stuff. This is what I want you to concentrate on."

He was sort of changing the focus of the book to make it a less superhero oriented and more what he called *urban horror* was the direction he was going with the book.

I do believe it's true that there couldn't be two at one time. And once one Hellspawn dies, there is an opening for the next one, and I don't recall anything about a time period in between.

- Q. In creating Dark Ages Spawn, were you directed by someone to create a Spawn character in a particular time period?
- A. Well, as I recall, this was a period where, you know -- because Todd had mostly published just the Spawn book with the occasional miniseries, like the Angela miniseries that was discussed earlier -- he was looking at this point to expand his publishing and create new books. And several ideas were tossed around and one of them was to make a, I guess you would call it, heroic fantasy or historical fantasy version of Spawn.

And I'm sure we talked about different periods.

- 1 The Middle Ages seemed the most appropriate for a
- 2 character. It's probably the most popular. You know,
- 3 we were trying to sell comic books. You know, we
- 4 | might have done, you know, Italian Renaissance Spawn,
- 5 | but I don't know if it would have sold very well, so
- 6 | it was something that was a natural fit for the
- 7 character.
- 8 Q. You said that another gentleman, Liam --
- 9 A. Liam Sharp.
- 10 Q. -- Liam Sharp, drew the character?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. Drew all the images for the issues?
- 13 A. Well, for the issues we worked on together, for
- 14 | the first 14 issues.
- 15 0. And tell me a little bit about how a writer and
- 16 an illustrator interact to come up with how the
- 17 | character should look.
- 18 A. Well, there is, you know, a lot of discussion.
- 19 | You tend to, or I tend to -- I don't want to
- 20 generalize -- let the artist have a lot of leeway.
- 21 You want your artist to be happy. If you are forcing
- 22 them to draw something they are not having fun
- 23 drawing, you are not going to end up with a
- 24 | particularly good product.
- 25 There is obviously certain elements of the

original Spawn we wanted to keep -- the spikes, the skull, I guess buckle or belt, whatever you would call it, the chains, some of the markings -- but there was an intention to make it a little more organic. You notice his spikes look more like horn or antler material as opposed to like steel, as they appear on the original Spawn, and the character is overall more feral and animalistic.

- Q. In creating this sort of historical fantasy series, did you have any prior background or interest in historical fantasy?
- 12 A. Oh, yeah. I'm a big fan of the fantasy genre and 13 I'm a big history buff, so yeah.
- 14 0. What about Liam, did he have any --
- 15 A. Oh, Liam, you know, that's his bread and butter.
- 16 He is an Englishman, you know, loves the Celtic
- 17 | mythology and Norseman mythology. And, you know, we
- 18 | talked about artists like Frank Frazetta or Simon
- 19 | Bisley or Don McGregor -- people who are very famous
- 20 | for that style of art. And, you know, that's why, I'm
- 21 | assuming, we settled on Liam, because this was a
- 22 | natural fit for him.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- Q. I'm going to throw up very quickly a page from
 Exhibit 1 just for reference. I think we have shown
- 25 | this before. This is actually a black light.

A. Mm-mm.

- $2 \parallel Q$. You see in the upper left -- well, first of all,
- 3 do you recognize this character as Medieval Spawn?
- $4 \parallel A$. That's the character that we are now referring to
- 5 as Medieval Spawn. I'm not sure he had a name in that
- 6 | appearance.
- 7 Q. And in the upper left-hand bubble, he says, "Good
- 8 day, Sweet Maiden. You are hurt. Do you see that?
- 9 | A. Yes.
- $10 \parallel Q$. And have you read the issue that includes
- 11 | Medieval Spawn?
- 12 A. A long time ago and I have, you know, reread it
- 13 | very recently, yes. We are discussing, you know, this
- 14 | matter.
- $15 \parallel Q$. And that character has a distinctive style of
- 16 speech?
- 17 A. Sort of courtly, genteel style of speech.
- $18 \parallel Q$. In writing the dialogue for *Dark Ages*, were you
- 19 | trying to emulate that style of speech?
- $20 \parallel A$. No, not at all.
- $21 \parallel Q$. I showed Mr. Gaiman earlier a page from the Spawn
- 22 | Bible describing Medieval Spawn.
- $23 \parallel A$. Mm-mm. Yes.
- 24 \parallel Q. When you were working on The Dark Ages series,
- 25 | had you ever seen that page from the Spawn Bible?

- 1 A. The first time I seen that page was this weekend.
- 2 | I wasn't even aware it existed.
- $3 \parallel Q$. Okay. Lord Covenant, the character that you
- 4 | created, was not a merchant's son?
- 5 | A. No.
- $6 \parallel Q$. He was a lord?
- $7 \parallel A$. He was a lord. He was a hereditary lord.
- 8 Q. Okay. And the character you created did not
- 9 fight in a civil war?
- 10 MR. ARNTSEN: Just object, leading again.
- 11 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 12 BY MR. GRIMSLEY:
- 13 Q. Did the character that you created fight in an
- 14 | English civil war?
- 15 A. No. He fought in the Crusades and died in the
- 16 | Crusades.
- 17 | Q. Did the character that you created, Lord
- 18 Covenant, fight a war in Ireland?
- 19 | A. No.
- 20 | Q. Did Lord -- did the character you created, was he
- 21 | killed in a battle in Ireland?
- 22 A. No. He was killed in the Holy Land.
- 23 Q. Where was he killed?
- $24 \parallel A$. In the Holy Land, in Jerusalem.
- $25 \parallel Q$. Okay. And why did Lord Covenant leave for the

1 Crusades?

2

3

6

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

- He thought it was his duty to his church and to his God.
- 4 And did he have any shame that he was trying to 5 escape?
 - No, not in particular.
- 7 Okay. Did the character Lord Covenant have an Q. affair with a handmaiden? 8
- He had an affair with, I believe, his sister's 9 10 attendant. I don't know if handmaiden was the word I used or not. It was a long time ago. 11
- When you were writing Dark Ages Spawn and 13 creating Lord Covenant, was there a backstory that you could draw on from Medieval Spawn?
 - No. I mean, I will -- you know, it doesn't surprise me that Mr. Gaiman said he had a backstory in mind because as a writer, that's sort of how you work, even if the character is a cab driver and has one line or he was thinking about who their history is, but I was never aware of it.

And in the eight pages I saw that where the character appears in Issue 9, there is nothing there to take. If you wanted to take a backstory, if that was the intention, there is nothing to take. character basically shows up and is almost immediately 1 killed.

- Q. In the first issue of *Dark Ages Spawn*, which was marked as Exhibit 22, there was a letter that you wrote; do you recall that?
- A. I wouldn't call it a letter, but there was a sort of introduction. And again, this has been, you know, more than ten years since the book came out and I had completely forgotten about this until I saw it yesterday, that in the back of the comic book there is usually an area where they have letter columns back in the days when people wrote letters and now it's probably an e-mail column.

As this was the first issue, there is obviously no fan mail yet. So I was asked, I think by Todd, it might have been by one of the editors, to write a little introduction or a piece about the work and what our thoughts and approaches to it were.

- Q. Okay. And I put a page up on the screen. I don't know if you can read this or not.
- 20 A. I can't. I would have to look at the original then.
- Q. Okay. I will bring you up a black and white copy.
- 24 | A. Okay.
- $25 \parallel Q$. Is this the letter that you wrote?

- 1 A. Again, I'm not sure I would call it a letter, but
- $2 \parallel \text{it's the essay I wrote.}$
- $3 \parallel Q$. Okay. The essay?
- 4 | A. Yeah.
- 5 Q. And you wrote this in or about February of 1999?
- 6 A. It sure looks like it, yes.
- $7 \parallel Q$. Okay. Above there is a blockened-in quote in the
- 8 | middle?
- 9 A. Yeah. A pull-quote?
- 10 | Q. Yeah. Then there is a paragraph right beneath
- 11 | that?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Can you just read that paragraph to us?
- 14 A. Yes. "Even casual fans of Spawn will recognize
- 15 | the framework. A flawed but ultimately good man finds
- 16 | himself at the mercy of a devil, who bargains with him
- 17 | for his soul. The mortal agrees to become a
- 18 | Hellspawn, a nascent soldier in the army of Hell, in
- 19 | exchange for a chance to return to earth and perhaps,
- 20 | just maybe, earn his salvation and free himself from
- 21 | the devil's grip."
- 22 | Q. So why are you referencing the framework of Spawn
- 23 | in that paragraph?
- $24 \parallel A$. I believe it was to let readers know, if they are
- 25 | Spawn fans, that this is part of the same overall

- 1 world, the same overall -- the same themes, but at the
- 2 same time it's a different inflection, a different
- 3 story, but that if you are a fan of the Spawn book, we
- 4 would like you to be a fan of this new book. And I
- 5 also wanted sort of to state what, to me, was the
- 6 interesting theme about the entire Spawn Universe.
- 7 Q. Okay. Do you recall if Liam Sharp also wrote an
- 8 essay?
- $9 \parallel A$. I believe he did, yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. Before I leave yours, can you read the
- 11 | short paragraph just above the large quote?
- 12 A. The one that starts with "Because?"
- 13 Q. Yes.
- $14 \parallel A$. Okay. "Because, in the end, this is a book that
- 15 | must (and I believe does) stand on its own. It must
- 16 | not only honor the Spawn tradition; it must add to
- 17 || it."
- 18 \parallel Q. So you wrote *Dark Ages* to stand on its own?
- 19 $\|$ A. And, as I say, to add to the tradition, the Spawn
- 20 | tradition. The idea was you could read just this book
- 21 | and get the whole story. You could read just Spawn
- 22 and get a story. If you read them both, you would get
- 23 | a bigger story, but they were all meant to be
- 24 | self-contained.
- $25 \parallel Q$. I'll put up another page, the very next page of

the same exhibit.

- A. Yeah. I believe that's Liam's little essay.
- $\mathsf{3} \parallel \mathsf{Q}$. Okay. And rather than hobble my way up there,
- 4 | let me see if I can read one of the paragraphs out.
- 5 It's in this right-hand column and it's the first full
- 6 | paragraph.

1

- 7 It begins, "Well, it's probably time to get off
- 8 my soap box and talk a little about the book in your
- 9 hands. I hope you can forgive me some liberties in
- 10 | history's telling. In most Arthurian tales, the sixth
- 11 century knights wear twelfth century amor, and Camelot
- 12 is never a wooden fort. Our story is likewise being
- 13 | handed down to us from the shadowy guess world of the
- 14 past, complete with the storyteller's embellishments.
- 15 | I have tried to get a genuine feel for the period and
- 16 | have kept real clear of fairy tale settings, while
- 17 | infusing the piece with, I hope, some sort of
- 18 contemporary sensibility."
- 19 Okay. And have you read that before?
- 20 A. Yes, I have.
- 21 | Q. Okay. The concept in there of avoiding fairy
- 22 | tales sensibilities, is that something you and Liam
- 23 | had discussed?
- $24 \parallel A$. Oh, yeah, very much so.
- 25 MR. ARNTSEN: Object, hearsay.

THE COURT: Well, not the fact that they discussed it.

> MR. GRIMSLEY: Right.

THE COURT: You can't talk about what he said, but you can say he discussed it.

- Yes, we did, we definitely discussed that subject.
- Okay. And in those discussions, what sort of 8 9 views were you expressing?
- You know, and I'm not someone who is a fan of some fairy tale sensibilities, but that wasn't this This book was meant to be dark and gritty and 13 Gothic and, you know, filled with mud and blood and sweat and bone. It was, you know, supposed to be a rough, tough comic book to appeal -- you know, that's sort of Spawn's fan base and we wanted to, you know, extend that sort of appeal.
- 18 Ο. Before today, you were familiar with Neil Gaiman?
- 19 Yes. Α.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

12

14

15

16

- 20 And you respect his work?
- 21 I'm quite a fan of his work, yes.
- 22 Were you surprised to hear Mr. Gaiman testify Q.
- 23 that your work really wasn't original?
- I'm not sure that's what he said. But I think if 24 25 the assertion is that Spawn: The Dark Ages is nothing

more than an imitation of eight pages of a character that has no locality, no backstory that's presented, you know, I will take Neil at his word that he had one in mind, but it's not on the page, it's not in that issue. You know, I defy anyone to find it in that issue.

It doesn't -- whatever motivations he has aren't clear. And whatever, you know, what we call a story art, where a character starts and where they end, it basically has none other than he starts off alive and ends up dead in a very few pages. That, I just don't see how that makes sense.

And if, you know, if I were asked, if Todd had asked me, said "Brian, why don't you go develop Medieval Spawn, give him a backstory, let's take this character and develop it into a star," I would have been happy to do it and I would like to think I would have done it well, but that wasn't what I was asked to do and that's not what we did.

Q. Okay. I'll put up another image. This is from Exhibit 33. Mr. Gaiman was asked if he recognized this image and he didn't. Do you recognize this character?

A. That is also Lord Covenant. I believe that's either a statue or an action figure based off the

- 1 Issue 1 cover which was done by Liam Sharp and painted 2 by Glen Fabry.
- $3 \parallel Q$. So this page from Exhibit 33 and then the toy
- 4 that you have in front of you as Exhibit 42, do those
- 5 depictions accurately capture the character that you
- 6 created in Dark Ages Spawn?
- 7 A. Yes. And this very much, both of them, capture
- 8 almost down to the lime work of the artist who did it.
- 9 MR. GRIMSLEY: Tender the witness.
- 10 THE COURT: Mr. Arntsen.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

- 12 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 13 Q. Mr. Holguin, you indicated that you have written
- 14 | a number of comics for Todd McFarlane?
- 15 | A. Yes.

- 16 | Q. You wrote -- how many of the original Spawns did
- 17 | you write?
- 18 A. Over 80.
- 19 Q. And in connection with that work, you had access
- 20 | to and were familiar with the entire body of the Spawn
- 21 comics, correct?
- 22 A. I wouldn't say I was familiar with the entire
- 23 body.
- 24 MR. GRIMSLEY: Objection.
- 25

BY MR. ARNTSEN:

1

- Q. You had access to the entire body?
- $3 \parallel A$. I wouldn't say I had access to the entire body.
- $4 \parallel Q$. What would -- in writing your versions of your
- 5 | Spawn comic books, what was to prevent you from
- 6 looking back at other Spawn comic books?
- 7 A. I mean, I don't think anything like physically
- 8 prevented me other than Todd just saying, "Forget
- 9 about that stuff. We are going in a new direction.
- 10 | This is what I want to concentrate on."
- 11 Q. And that's what Todd told you when you were
- 12 writing the original Spawn?
- 13 A. Yes. When I started, to use the backup, when I
- 14 started on Spawn, at first I was -- can I give you a
- 15 | little background on how comics are created, the
- 16 process of it?
- 17 || THE COURT: It's up to Mr. Arntsen. He is
- 18 | the examiner right now.
- 19 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 20 0. Okay. Go ahead.
- 21 A. Todd worked with the artist Greg Capullo with
- 22 what's called the Marvel method where Todd and Greg
- 23 would roughly work out the plot of the story, what
- 24 | happens, the action involved, and then would later
- 25 | write the dialogue. It wasn't written in a full

1 script.

2

3

4

5

6

When I started on *Spawn*, Todd was still doing the plot and then handing it to me after the art was done and I would write the script. After, I don't know how many, maybe six issues, I took over the overall doing both elements of that story in consultation with Todd.

- $7 \parallel Q$. What *Spawn* number did you start writing in?
- 8 A. 70 or 71.
- 9 Q. So then after you got to the late 70s, then you
- 10 were taking --
- 11 A. Right --
- 12 || Q. -- care of the story then?
- 13 A. -- definitely by Issue 80 I was. But again, it
- 14 was all in consultation with Todd.
- 15 \parallel Q. And you wrote Spawn 97 to 100, correct --
- 16 \parallel A. Absolutely.
- 17 | Q. -- which featured Angela, correct?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 | Q. So in connection with that, you had reviewed
- 20 | Spawn 9, correct?
- 21 A. I don't know if I reviewed it specifically in
- 22 connection with that. But, yeah, I had -- I was aware
- 23 of that issue at that point.
- $24 \parallel Q$. Yeah. And were you aware of *Spawn* 14 and 15?
- 25 | A. I don't think I've ever read 14 and 15.

- Q. Okay. So as you sit here today, you can't tell
- 2 \parallel me what are in *Spawn* 14 or 15 at all?
- $3 \parallel A$. I don't think so.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Okay. Did you ever write any stories that had
- 5 | the Violator?
- $6 \parallel A$. Yes.

- $7 \parallel Q$. And in connection -- and are you aware that the
- 8 Violator is in Spawn 14 and 15?
- $9 \parallel A$. I don't believe he is only in 14 or 15.
- 10 \parallel Q. No, but are you aware that he is in there?
- 11 A. I am now. I wasn't aware of it.
- 12 Q. Okay. And so in writing comics that are drawing
- 13 | on existing characters, you were comfortable starting
- 14 over without seeing what had been said before about
- 15 | these characters?
- 16 A. I wouldn't say "without seeing." I hadn't read
- $17 \parallel$ all of them. You know, there were 70 issues before I
- 18 started. I had read probably 25, 30 of them. I had
- 19 | not only seen the HBO animated show, I had actually
- 20 done some work on it.
- 21 I can't remember if I -- the movie came out
- 22 | before I had started on the book or very close to
- 23 about that time and I had long conversations with Todd
- $24 \parallel$ about who the characters were. But he did want to get
- 25 | away from certain characters like Overkill and Tremor

- 1 and these sort of comic-booky supervillains and get a
- 2 | lot grittier that had a lot more to do with urban
- 3 crime, more horror stories, that element, so he didn't
- 4 want me to fill my head with a style of storytelling
- 5 that he was trying to get away from.
- 6 Q. Here, I will show you. We don't need to
- 7 | speculate. I will show you what have been marked
- 8 Exhibits 2 and 3.
- $9 \parallel A$. Mm-mm.
- 10 MR. ARNTSEN: May I stay up here just for a
- 11 | moment, Your Honor?
- 12 THE COURT: Sure.
- 13 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 14 \parallel Q. Do you see that on Exhibit 2 is Spawn 14 and
- 15 | Exhibit 3 is *Spawn* 15?
- 16 A. That's -- yes.
- 17 || Q. And the Violator is pictured?
- $18 \parallel A$. The Violator is there, yes, and his alter ego the
- 19 | Clown.
- 20 | Q. And have you written stories with the Clown?
- 21 A. Yes, I have.
- 22 Q. Do these refresh your recollection as to whether
- 23 you have seen these before?
- $24 \parallel A$. I definitely haven't seen that before.
- THE COURT: When you say "that," which one?

THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. Issue 15, the one that has the Medieval Spawn character on the cover.

And I don't believe I have seen this. This looks like a pretty generic kind of pinup of the Violator. There is a lot of images like that, so I can't say for sure I have never seen that, but I don't recall seeing that one.

8 BY MR. ARNTSEN:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

- Q. But again, had you wanted, in connection with you writing a comic about the Violator, there was nothing to stop you from looking back at prior comics that had the Violator, correct?
- MR. GRIMSLEY: Relevance, Your Honor, as to the character involved and as to the hypothetical.

THE COURT: Overruled.

- 16 A. I'm sorry. The question again?
- Q. If you were to embark on writing a comic with the Violator, there was nothing to stop you from looking at prior comics that --
- $20 \parallel A$. Right.
- 21 Q. -- used the Violator?
- A. The most I would have asked Todd were questions
 like, "Would the Violator do X or Y? Can I make him
 do this?" you know, as opposed to, "Can you get me
 Issue 15 and FedEx it to my house so I can read it and

- 1 then probably still call you with questions?"
- $2 \parallel Q$. But again, just to be clear, you had access to
- 3 | the prior *Spawn* comics?
- 4 | A. Yes.
- 5 MR. GRIMSLEY: Asked and answered.
- 6 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 7 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 8 Q. And just following up, are you aware, as you sit
- 9 here today, that *Spawn* 14 and 15, in addition to
- 10 | featuring the Violator, featured Medieval Spawn?
- 11 MR. GRIMSLEY: Relevance.
- 12 A. I saw Medieval Spawn on that cover, so I had
- 13 | assumed it features him inside.
- 14 Q. Showing you a page of Exhibit 2, does that show
- 15 | Medieval Spawn?
- 16 A. Yeah. That's the Spawn character that everyone
- 17 | is going to call the Medieval Spawn, yes.
- 18 Q. And are you familiar with the unmasked Medieval
- 19 | Spawn --
- 20 A. I never seen that before.
- 21 | Q. -- which is in Exhibit 3? Who made the decision
- 22 to set Dark Ages Spawn in the twelfth century?
- 23 A. The date would have been me. I mean, it was tied
- 24 | to the period of the Crusades. There was a very
- 25 | specific historical event we wanted to tie the

- 1 character to.
- $2 \parallel Q$. You indicated that you consider yourself a
- 3 creator. Strike that. You testified earlier that you
- 4 considered yourself a creator of Lord Covenant,
- 5 | correct?
- 6 A. "A" creator. I wouldn't consider myself a sole
- 7 creator.
- $8 \parallel Q$. No, but a creator --
- 9 | A. Yes.
- 10 | Q. -- along with others? So do you get royalties on
- 11 | the Lord Covenant toys?
- 12 | A. Uh --
- MR. GRIMSLEY: Relevance, Your Honor.
- 14 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 15 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 16 || Q. And in one of the initial story lines of Dark
- 17 | Ages Spawn 1 through 4, there is sort of a battle
- 18 | between Lord Covenant and his -- the person who was
- 19 | his brother-in-law when he was alive, Baron Rivalen,
- 20 correct?
- 21 A. I know Baron Rivalen. I haven't seen these books
- 22 for a decade. I've, you know, had a chance to sort of
- 23 thumb through them. Baron was definitely an
- 24 | antagonist. I don't really recall if that's his
- 25 | brother-in-law or what their relationship was.

- Q. Do you know whether Baron Rivalen was very --
- $2 \parallel A$. I can't recall that. You know, I'm not
- 3 disputing. I'm saying I can't remember what their
- 4 | relationship was.

- $5 \parallel Q$. It's just whatever it says in the comic?
- 6 A. Right. Whatever that says is what it was
- 7 | intended to be.
- 8 Q. Do you recall Lord Covenant's sister, Eloise?
- 9 A. I recall Rivalen's wife, Eloise. I don't know if
- 10 | I remember if that was Covenant's sister or cousin or
- 11 what their relationship was.
- 12 | Q. Over the years that you have worked for him, how
- 13 | much has Mr. McFarlane paid you in total?
- 14 MR. GRIMSLEY: Relevance.
- 15 MR. ARNTSEN: This goes to bias, Your Honor.
- 16 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 17 A. I have no idea. I couldn't guess.
- $18 \parallel Q$. Approximately.
- 19 A. I mean, well into the thousands.
- 20 | Q. Well, how much are you paid per comic?
- 21 A. It depends on the comic.
- 22 Q. What's the range?
- 23 A. Between, you know, three and \$5,000.
- 24 || Q. Okay. And you wrote 70 issues of *Spawn*?
- 25 \parallel A. 80 issues of *Spawn* and probably 50 issues of

- 1 other things --
- $2 \parallel Q$. Okay. So it would be --
- $3 \parallel A$. -- maybe more.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Okay. So it's at least 130 issues at three to
- 5 \$5,000 an issue?
- 6 A. Mm-mm, over, whatever it's been, 12 years.
- $7 \parallel Q$. You testified earlier, I believe you said you
- 8 wrote the first 14 issues of Spawn Dark Ages?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 \parallel Q. I will show you what's been marked as Exhibit 47.
- 11 Do you recognize this as Spawn Dark Ages 8?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And you wrote that?
- 14 | A. Yes.
- $15 \parallel Q$. And I will just turn you to a page. And this
- 16 | shows Lord Covenant, correct?
- 17 | A. That's correct.
- 18 | Q. And you wrote the dialogue?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- $20 \parallel Q$. Can you just read the dialogue on that page --
- 21 A. Sure.
- 22 Q. -- aloud, please?
- 23 A. Yeah. I'm trying to get my eyes focused. "You
- 24 | say this angel, this seraphic huntress, as you call
- 25 her, she is out to slay me. Very well then I say yes.

- I'm glad of it. I am ready for the dark embrace of the grave. This is no life for a man."
- Q. Okay. Would you describe that as talking medieval?

A. No. I mean, if you wanted it to talk medieval, you know, I don't know if you've read the *Canterbury Tales* or *Beowulf* when you were in school, but that is medieval English. You know, it might be fun to try and write a comic in that style. I don't think we would sell many copies of it.

THE COURT: I don't either.

- A. And I believe Mr. Gaiman testified that there is no such language as medieval, that medieval is a time period, you know. And to my mind, it's the period of greater Europe, roughly between the fall of Rome and the onset of the Renaissance.
- Q. Would you characterize that manner of speaking that you just read in that's how people talk now?
- little, I don't know, you know, it's a little flowery, which is atypical for that character, but it was, you know, a dramatic moment. You know, sort of dramatic monologues are kind of bread and butter in the comic book industry.

MR. ARNTSEN: That's all I have got. Thank

Some people might. It's a little poetic. It's a

And then you take that piece of the story -which is, I betrayed everything to come back to my own
life -- and you go, fine, sign on the dotted line,
which is the deal we make with the devil. And you
come back and the world is topsy-turvy and now what do
you do? You find out that your wife, the only thing
you came back for -- this love, this great love of
yours -- she is now remarried, she has had a child.
He wasn't able to bear children with her.

And now he finds out he has got these fantastic powers -- and I will get into the comic book part of it -- he has these fantastic powers. His identity has been stripped from him. He has no skin. He is not recognizable.

And now he goes, "Wow! The one thing I wanted to do was just to get back to my wife. She has got children, which makes her happy. She is married to a good guy, which is my best friend. So of all the guys in the world that I would like to take care of my wife, that would be him. And now I have got all of these sort of crazy powers and forces, no identity, what now?" And it just becomes the beginning of the journey of the hero quest.

Q. In these first eight issues of *Spawn*, is there some explanation of the role of a Hellspawn?

A. Yeah. I think it's mentioned in numerous issues from 1 to 8.

Q. What is the role; what do they do?

A. In its simplest form, there is, you know, using biblical terms, there is sort of this big buildup for Armageddon or the Apocalypse, whatever term you want to use, and that both sides, Heaven or Hell, must build up armies. I mean, somebody is going to win the fight, I presume, some day, so both of them are building up their armies.

And so what you need is not only do you need soldiers and grunts in those armies, but you also need generals in those armies. And so you build the army of these characters and then you start training some of the officers. And the Spawns that are now on Earth are those sort of officers in training to see if they can cut muster, as you will infer from this, before the big buildup of the battle between Heaven and Hell.

Q. Mr. Gaiman testified that the idea that Hell's army is ramping up to battle Heaven, that the opponent was Heaven was his idea. Is that true?

A. No, that's not true. As a matter of fact, if you look at the first eight issues, there are a handful of

MR. ARNTSEN: Object. That misstates

indications of that, of people saying that out loud.

Mr. Gaiman's testimony.

THE COURT: Sustained.

BY MR. GRIMSLEY:

- Q. I'm going to show you a page from Issue 1 of Spawn, which is marked as Exhibit 36. And there is a logo on that page?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Do you recognize that?
- 9 | A. Yeah.
- 10 Q. And what is that logo?
 - A. It's what we call the Spawn logo shield that has been on the inside front cover of I think almost the first hundred-plus issues of Spawn. I use it pretty much whenever I'm sort of indicating that Spawn has some connection to this, the preexisting Spawn from Issue 1. I try to put it in as much as possible just to sort of say Spawn was here.

It's, in its simplest core -- and let's see if I can explain what it's supposed to be -- it's two things. It's the mark on his mask. It's sort of just a simplified version of the mark on his mask. So this one actually doesn't have the circle around it. Half of them print it without a circle, so there is some do, some don't. But you are going to see that in sort of a lot of different places and it's basically his

mask mark.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

And what it's there for is, if you say, to a lot of people, you can't draw Superman; you can only draw one thing. I think most people, if you put the "S", you go, "Oh, that S in the diamond, that's Superman."

If you see the bat with the logo around it, you go, "Oh, that's Batman's logo."

There is another guy named *The Flash* which has got an electric bolt with a circle. "Oh, that's the" -- everybody has -- the old-fashioned guys sort of all have their own logo.

And I was a fan of comic books for a long time and the history of comic books, so I would go, "If it worked for Superman and Batman, why wouldn't it work for me. So I created my own S, if you will, for this subject.

- Q. When you were drawing the character that we are now calling *Medieval Spawn* --
- 19 | A. Uh-huh.
- 20 | Q. -- did you use this logo?
- 21 A. Yeah, the logo shield on the shield, right.
- 22 Q. And so that derived from a preexisting idea,
- 23 | right?
- A. Yeah, that's right, it's that. It's just the mark of the mask on the shield, right.

- $1 \parallel Q$. Now, Issue 9, which was marked as Exhibit 1, Neil
- 2 wrote the script?
- $3 \parallel A$. Neil wrote the script, you said?
- $4 \parallel Q$. Did Neil write the script?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. And you illustrated the issue?
- 7 | A. Yes.
- 8 | Q. In Neil's script, did he ever reference the name
- 9 | Medieval Spawn?
- 10 A. No. As a matter of fact, quite contrary. Every
- 11 | time the character that we are now referring to as
- 12 Medieval Spawn, in the script, the actual script, his
- 13 | name is Spawn.
- 14 There is two characters that we are talking about
- 15 | today, the preexisting Spawn and the Medieval Spawn.
- 16 The script he gave me, in every single instance,
- 17 | refers to both of them as Spawn. He made no
- 18 distinction between the two of them.
- 19 \parallel Q. Did he later participate in coming up with the
- 20 | name of *Medieval Spawn*?
- 21 A. No.
- $22 \parallel Q$. Neil said that you were excited by the creation
- 23 of Medieval Spawn because you could do a toy. Is that
- 24 | true?
- 25 \parallel A. No, it's not. He either -- I don't want to say

lie -- he either misspoke or misunderstood. He is getting his times mixed up. At the time of Issue

No. 9, the toy company wasn't even in existence, or if it was, we were a long ways before launching our first toy line, so we weren't there yet.

- Q. When you drew the character that we are now calling *Medieval Spawn*, did you use certain elements, other than the logo, from the preexisting Spawn?
- A. Yeah. Not some, I used almost every single one of them. So if you want me to go down, I will walk you through it if you want.
- Q. Sure.

A. Okay. So let's just -- Spawn has a mask that's got the white marks on it. The Medieval Spawn, the character we are calling Medieval Spawn, his -- the thing we are calling his helmet now, the mark -- the shape of that helmet is this mark right here, the one that we are calling the shield right here.

The Spawn, the original Spawn, preexisting Spawn, had green eyes; the Medieval Spawn has green eyes.

The preexisting Spawn had a red cloak; Medieval Spawn had a red cloak.

The preexisting Spawn had spikes on his arms and legs; the Medieval Spawn had spikes on his arms and legs; not exactly the same amount of them, but still

spikes nonetheless.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

The original Spawn had a big mark on his chest, which was an M -- and I won't digress as to what the M means right now -- and the Medieval Spawn has a big M on his chest.

The original Spawn has a skull on his belly and the Medieval Spawn has a skull on his belly.

The original Spawn has chains; the Medieval Spawn has chains.

So essentially, I took the original costume and just gave it a little bit different veneer. It essentially is a Spawn costume. In the script, that's exactly how it's referenced, just make a Spawn costume.

- Q. Exhibit 37, Spawn Issue 8, there was an image in Spawn 8. I want to see if you can describe for us this image, if you can make that out.
- 18 A. Yeah.
- 19 Q. What are we seeing in that image?
- 20 A. This is from Issue 8, you said?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- A. This is the -- this, Mark wrote and I drew. This is showing, this big thing here, the costume coming alive again, you know. Again, part of the backstory of Spawn is that his costume is a living sentinel

Spawn's costume is alive, so it actually can sort of morph and change and do different things and it can take different shapes. So this is just another indication here that without having a body in it, the costume is alive, in and of itself, without having anything sort of human in it, if you will.

- Q. Okay. And even without a body in it, I see there are spikes on the shoulders; is that correct?
- A. Yeah. Looks like spikes on the shoulders, spikes on the hands, skulls, chains, the mark on the face, the green eyes, the big M on the chest, so all the conventions of preexisting Spawn uniform.
- 17 Q. Okay. And the white part of the face, that 18 mask --
- 19 | A. Yeah.

6

7

8

9

- 20 Q. -- let me show you an image from Issue 9, the 21 Medieval Spawn. This --
- 22 A. Yeah, I can see it.
- 23 Q. -- this mask --
- 24 | A. Yeah.
- $25 \parallel Q$. -- are those of similar shape?

1 Right. And can I just say, you don't have to 2 I mean, I draw this stuff, so I recognize it worry. 3 all, so I don't need as much clarity as anybody else 4 probably. So, yeah, what's similar there, which 5 always go back to the original costume and those two circles, is that he has got the white mark --6 7 essentially that shield, that logo shield -- and then the protrudent, which is basically the spikes at the 8 top and then the spikes at the bottom of it. And then 9 10 it's got the green slits, which is the green eyes, so there is a consistency in all the costumes. 11

- Q. Okay. I'm going to bring you a document that was marked as Exhibit 41. And take a moment, flip through the pages. I'm going to ask you first if you recognize that document.
- 16 A. Yeah. I believe this is a part of a prior filing 17 to some court, possibly this one.
- 18 Q. Okay. Did you have anything to do with putting 19 this document together?
- 20 A. Yeah, some of the images, yeah.

12

13

14

15

22

23

24

- $21 \parallel Q$. Okay. Do you recall what the purpose was?
 - A. Yeah. In its simplest form -- and maybe I have a personal bias as an artist -- I think people will understand more visually than to say, "Hey, they both have this, they both have that." The easiest thing is

just sort of show people stuff.

So I think when we were having a discussion and we had the file -- I deal with lawyers a lot, more than I probably should -- but they sort of write nice big, long dialogue stuff. But I just go, "Why don't we just show them? You are talking about it. Isn't it easier to just sort of show them and walk them through it and to indicate that a lot of the things that they are saying are similar about this character, Medieval Spawn, preexisted? It's all from the original Spawn."

And so I just wanted to sort of do a comparison chart, if you will, to go -- they are contending it's coming from Medieval Spawn. But the stuff that's in Medieval Spawn came from the original preexisting Spawn, so I'm just trying to bring it back to the origin of where all of it sort of blossoms.

- Q. Okay. So I put up the first page of this exhibit.
- 20 | A. Okay.
- 21 Q. And the illustration on the left-hand side of the 22 page is which character?
- 23 A. Is the original, preexisting Spawn from Issue 1.
- $24 \parallel Q$. Okay. And the character on the right?
- \parallel A. Is I think -- I believe this is the cover for

- 1 Dark Ages Spawn 1, No. 1.
- 2 | Q. And what are the similarities, you know, the
- 3 aspects of Dark Ages Spawn and the original Spawn,
- 4 which you are trying to point out on that comparison?
- 5 A. Without pointing to everything, I think we listed
- 6 them up top -- big red capes, claw hands, costume
- 7 colors, green eyes, M stripe on the chest, neck and
- 8 skull with chains, skull belt buckles, spikes on the
- 9 leg boots, spikes on the arm. All those are
- 10 consistent with the original, preexisting Spawn.
- 11 MR. GRIMSLEY: Your Honor, if it helps, this
- 12 \parallel was Exhibit C to our brief that was filed previously.
- 13 BY MR. GRIMSLEY:
- 14 Q. Let's look at the next page.
- 15 A. In this grouping of paper? Okay.
- 16 \parallel Q. And at the top, which character are we seeing?
- 17 A. It's a panel from Dark Ages Spawn.
- $18 \parallel Q$. Okay. And at the bottom?
- $19 \parallel A$. The original preexisting Spawn. And I think this
- 20 | could bear something just to say, they have both got
- 21 | big, red capes, so that's always been there for the
- 22 character.
- 23 | Q. Okay. And this page, the next page over, what's
- 24 | being compared there?
- 25 A. A couple things; one, just sort of showing their

gnarly skin, because again, all of the Spawns have had their flesh ripped from them and it's part of the beginning of it. They strip their identity away from them. And just to show on the top panel, the guy has got sort of gnarly skin and sort of claw hand.

And then the panel down at the bottom is a panel from Issue No. 1. It's got the gnarly hand of the preexisting original Spawn and the claw hand. And then you can see, even when the uniform takes over the symbia, he still has sort of a claw hand.

- And then we will turn to the next page of the exhibit.
- 13 Α. Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- And what are you trying to show with these images? 15
 - All Spawns -- not just from this panel, not just -- every Spawn has green eyes. And I will give you a little bit of backstory in a moment, but -- and then all the panels down below are panels from Issue No. 1, I believe, or at least 1 through 8, but mostly it looks like from Issue No. 1.

They all have green eyes. The origin of that idea is that going back to Sunday school teachings, they give you this thing that we are all created in the likeness of our master. Well, in this case, his master isn't God, it's the devil.

And when you see Malebolgia -- which is the name of the devil, Malebolgia (the M on his chest) -- Malebolgia has green eyes. So if you are looking for the connection between, you know, your maker -- "you are going to go meet your maker" -- in this case, Spawn goes, "Oh, my gosh. My maker is not God, it's now Satan," or a variation of the devil.

So if look through Issue 1 through 8, every time you see Malebolgia, he has green eyes, too, so it's just an indication of they both come from the same place.

- Q. The next page in this document?
- A. The next page is to show, as I had mentioned before, the whole thing is part of the trickeries to strip the identity away from him. It served -- stop me if I digress, please -- it served two purposes.

 One is this sort of melodramatic of, "You come back. Nobody recognizes you. We are going to strip your identity."

The other part was, Al Simmons, in the original comic book, is African American. Historically, African-American superheros, I don't believe, get their fair shake. This is somebody who has lived African American. I think they get the short end of

the stick a lot of times.

So I set out when I left Marvel to create a character that is African American but get rid of the one thing that we have a tendency to do when we look at people that aren't the same as us, is we just make instant judgment. And the reason we don't like people of color is because of the color of their skin, so just made a solution, strip the skin off it, get away from that.

Every time in comic book history they try to do something that is a minority character, they draw attention to it. I wanted to actually be the opposite. I wanted to sort of take that piece and make it go away so that Spawn just became this hero, regardless of whatever his skin color was.

So besides my personal philosophical input, the other part is just, "You want to go see your wife?

Ha-ha-ha! I'm the devil. I'm going to trick you.

I'm going to strip your skin off you. And even if you go see her, she is never going to recognize you."

- Q. And the next page of this exhibit?
- A. The next page is one of the things that the original Spawn finds out early on in the Issues 1 through 8 is he is not human. He is actually not even made out of flesh and blood.

Those green eyes, if you think about it as a pumpkin, it's sort of like the glow of a pumpkin, so he actually doesn't even have eyes. If you went and put your finger where it was, it would actually go in like a pumpkin where you carve out the eye.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

25

So this is sort of a moment where he sort of finds out "I'm made out of something else," because now where his heart should be in the inside of him, instead of blood pouring out, he has got this green stuff that we refer to as necroplasm.

And then this panel up top is just, you know, the Dark Ages Spawn gets injured. He has a hole in him and it has the green necroplasm gooing out of him. That's what happens when you sort of shoot them. They don't really die, per se.

- So you are showing the character -- this is one of the characteristics?
- Yeah, taking one of the obvious mechanisms of the original Spawn.
- And in this comparison, what is this showing that 21 is similar between the characters?
 - One of the other things, and this probably isn't as good of a representation as I could grab with some other stuff, but again, the whole M sequence. mask, there is Malebolgia, this devil character.

so all the costumes have the mark of the beast, if you will, which is, you know, the big giant M.

So whenever you look and they happen to have their costumes on, you are going to see the M a lot of times. I'm sure, when it's the regular Spawn. But in most of the variations that I have done in the comics and toys, they have some type of M mark on them, for the most part.

Q. And this comparison was the next page.

A. That's just the original Spawn. He has got a cloak, like I said, big red cape, but he also is tied down by skulls a lot of times, so the skulls in the motif. I mean, the whole skull and spike stuff is just cool stuff. I mean, I hate to sort of be overly simple, but a lot of stuff that I create, it has to fall into a cool factor for me.

And when I was creating this character, kids sort of like dark and skulls -- you see them on T-shirts -- and spikes, make him look like a dude. But anyways, the cloak is attached by two skulls and chains, both the Dark Ages Spawn and the original Spawn.

- Q. Okay. And then the next page just shows the skull belt buckle on both characters?
- A. Skull, yeah, and that the chains come off him, for the most part, you know -- sometimes they are,

- 1 sometimes they are not -- because everything is
- 2 | living, even the chains. I mean, in my mind, tongues
- 3 and arms and hands, they just are components of a
- 4 | costume.
- 5 Q. And the next page shows that they both have
- 6 spikes on their leg boot; is that correct?
- 7 A. Yeah. Yes. Spikes is a big part of the Spawn
- 8 character. He has them on his hands and his arms and
- 9 his legs.
- $10 \parallel Q$. And all of the characteristics that are similar
- 11 between the original Spawn and Dark Ages Spawn that
- 12 you set forth on Exhibit 41, did all of those elements
- 13 precede the creation of Medieval Spawn?
- 14 | A. Yes.
- $15 \parallel Q$. Todd, there is a group of toys up there in front
- 16 of you.
- 17 | A. Okay.
- 18 Q. Let's start with the one that's closest to you
- 19 | that's titled "Lord Covenant."
- 20 | A. Okay.
- 21 Q. Do you recognize that toy?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay. And which comic book series is that
- 24 | associated with?
- 25 A. The Dark Ages Spawn.

- $1 \parallel Q$. Okay. And that's the main character in The Dark
- 2 | Ages Spawn?
- 3 A. Yes, Lord Covenant.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Okay. Then over just beyond your water pitcher
- 5 there are two other toys, if you can reach those.
- 6 A. Both of them?
- $7 \mid Q$. Yes.
- 8 | A. Okay.
- $9 \parallel Q$. And what are those two toys?
- 10 A. One is the original Spawn and the other one is
- 11 | the one called Medieval Spawn.
- 12 Q. Okay. And is there a number on the back of
- 13 | Medieval Spawn, just for identification?
- 14 A. An exhibit number? 43.
- $15 \parallel Q$. Okay. So 43 is a Medieval Spawn?
- 16 A. Yes.
- $17 \parallel Q$. And was that Medieval Spawn toy fairly popular?
- $18 \parallel A$. The Spawn line, as a whole, was popular. I think
- 19 we did six of them. There is a picture of all the
- 20 | characters we did on the back. I think they all did
- 21 good, but people liked the Spawn characters.
- 22 | Q. Was the idea of creating Dark Ages Spawn to draw
- 23 on the popularity of the Medieval Spawn character?
- 24 A. No. It was to draw on the popularity of Spawn.
- 25 \parallel Everything goes back to the origin of Spawn. It's all

- 1 | about Spawn.
- 2 | Q. I'm going to put up what's been marked as Exhibit
- 3 39. I'm going to put up one page at a time. I'll put
- 4 the first page and just ask generally if you recognize
- 5 the first page of Exhibit 39.
- 6 A. That's a cover to the catalogue called *Previews*.
- 7 | I think it's been mentioned before. This is this big,
- 8 | thick book that they solicit all the comic book items
- 9 | in the comic book industry.
- 10 | Q. And do you recognize the character that is on the
- 11 cover of this issue?
- 12 A. Yeah. I think that's the image of Dark Ages, the
- 13 || Spawn: Dark Ages cover to Issue No. 1.
- $14 \parallel Q$. Okay. Then the last page of the exhibit is here.
- 15 | A. Okay.
- 16 Q. There is some text on the right-hand side of the
- 17 page.
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. There was some discussion earlier about a
- 20 | solicitation.
- 21 A. Right.
- 22 Q. Is that what this refers to?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Okay. So this is the solicitation for Spawn: The
- 25 Dark Ages?

A. Right. And again, I don't know if they made it clear. This is sort of generally how -- and you are going to see this when you look through this book -- you sort of give an image or images -- it may or may not be the cover, but just some artwork -- and then a little synopsis, the price, when it's coming out.

And then the dealers either read this book or they don't and then they make the choices whether they read the book or they don't, so you try to give them helpful tools. Whether they use it, you don't get to control that.

- Q. Is that the main way that you market comic book issues to retailers?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- Q. In marketing *The Dark Ages* series to the retailers, was any reference ever made to Medieval Spawn?
- 18 | A. No.

- Q. If you had wanted to draw on the popularity of
 Medieval Spawn in marketing Dark Ages, would you have
 done anything differently?
 - A. The obvious thing, we would have actually mentioned it. Let's just sort of be fairly obvious here. We are all skilled -- Neil, myself, Brian -- all of us. We are all skilled. If we want something

to look like something, we can do it. That's why there are 600 issues of *Superman*. We can make stuff look like other stuff and give it some kind of consistency.

And then from a marketing point of view, and I own -- you know, my companies have grown since Neil and I first met each other when I was working over a garage, so again, most of Neil and my interaction was when I was working over a garage with a couple of people working with me.

As the years have gone by and I have gotten better at marketing, of course you draw attention to the things that are going to bring you value, the things that are going to get you the extra sales, the things that are going to get you attention. And the things that you will find, for the most part, everything that I did, it all goes back to Spawn. The value is Spawn.

So the mention that anything is in there, I couldn't read it, but I'm betting it says something about going back to the Spawn intros or Spawn himself or something. You are going back to the "A" guy. You don't start dealing with the guys that are below the "A" guy.

Q. There was some discussion earlier about Exhibits

- $1 \parallel 2$ and 3, which are Issues 14 and 15.
- 2 | A. Okay.
- 3 Q. Do you recall those issues generally?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 Q. Okay. And those issues utilized the, what we are
- 6 now calling, the *Medieval Spawn* character?
- 7 A. Yeah, I think portions of it.
- 8 Q. Okay. And in 14 and 15, the character is drawn
- 9 in the style as he appears in Issue 9?
- 10 A. I presume so, yeah.
- 11 Q. Okay. I can bring it up to you if you want to
- 12 | flip through it.
- 13 A. No. I will take your word for it. I don't see
- 14 where we got crazy on the uniform.
- $15 \parallel Q$. And in Issues 14 and 15, did you try to mimic the
- 16 | style of speech from Issue 9?
- 17 | A. Of the Medieval Spawn?
- 18 Q. The Medieval Spawn character.
- 19 | A. Yeah. Yep.
- $20 \parallel Q$. You don't dispute that the character that appears
- 21 | in Issues 14 and 15 is the same as the character who
- 22 appeared in Issue 9 --
- 23 A. No.
- 24 | Q. -- the Medieval Spawn character?
- 25 A. No, I don't dispute that.

Q. Okay. And if you had intended to continue that in Dark Ages Spawn, you would have continued that same look?

A. Right. Like I say, we all like to think of ourselves to be fairly talented. If the intent was for me to do a Medieval Spawn comic book, a couple things would have happened:

It would have been called *Medieval Spawn*, sort of easy stuff;

It would have looked like Medieval Spawn; and
We would have just sort of led to any components,
of which there weren't a lot, from Issues 9 and 14 and
50 to go.

That wasn't the intent. It's not because we were trying to be devious, because there is a more obvious answer, because we weren't trying to do that. And so Issue 14 and 15 was me replicating something that I had seen before, which is Issue 9.

Dark Ages Spawn wasn't replicating that because we could have made it look like that. Liam Sharp is a tremendously skilled artist. He could have made it look like, quote/unquote, Medieval Spawn; he didn't. We came up with another character with another look based on the components and the mechanisms of the original preexisting Spawn and all the backstories on

- 1 | him.
- 2 | Q. Issue 9, which was marked as Exhibit No. 1, also
- 3 | introduced a character, Angela, correct?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- $5 \parallel Q$. I will just bring this to you so you can refer to
- 6 | it if you wish. And you drew the images of the
- 7 character Angela?
- 8 | A. Yes, I did --
- 9 | Q. Okay.
- $10 \parallel A$. -- in this issue.
- 11 0. In this issue.
- 12 | A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Okay. Were there elements of Angela that you
- 14 | took from the original -- the preexisting Spawn
- 15 | character himself?
- 16 A. Yes, I did.
- 17 | Q. And what elements were those?
- 18 A. Well, let's just look at it, a couple of dynamics
- 19 of drawing. The biggest, as an artist -- and again, I
- 20 | know we have got a couple writers, so let me do a
- 21 | little art here -- what we do as an artist, we have a
- 22 | flat piece of paper, it's two dimensional. Our trick
- 23 | is create depth and illusion in 3-D.
- 24 So the things you can use in drawing are things
- 25 | like cape in the wind and hair and all these other

components. I can make something look pretty dramatic, even though they are just saying "pass the coffee," as long as I have got the right components that are there.

So for Spawn, he has got his chains are going.

He's got his cowls going around. He's got chains that are going. He's got magic spells that are going there, so we start using those. So let's just look at some of the direct stuff and then I will get into some of the stuff that's a little more ambiguous than that.

The mark on her face is a direct replication of Spawn's mark on his face. The only difference is it's black. Now, why is it black? Easy conventions here. Let's just go to cowboys and Indians and some of the other conventions in the world. The good guy wears the white hat, the bad guy wears the black hat, and we just have these sort of stereotypes throughout sort of literary hero verses bad guy.

So it's not sort of a stretch to say whatever the mark is for the Hell guy, the angels got the opposite, because we are taught they are the opposite in everything we do here. So she has blank eyes; oh, Spawn has blank eyes. They are not green because that would mean that she is part of the devil's green eyes. She is not a devil warrior; she's a Heaven warrior.

The mark, if you look at it, it's got the points coming down the cheek. And if you took the headdress off, it comes up in here. It's the opposite to say "I'm the opposite of you." All you got to do is see me from the neck up, bald even, and you are going to know which of us is a good guy and which one of us is a bad guy within the confines of it.

She's also got the earrings. The earrings have the Spawn mark on the earrings there. And then as we start getting into some of the sort of broader conventions, he has got sharp imagery on him, which is the spikes. So you see she's got the stuff on her shoulder that's sort of sharp. Even the wings on the helmet are a little sharp.

But again, let's just go to the sort of easy conventions of angels. When somebody says to you, "Oh, an angel," we think wings. It's kind of difficult to fight with big, giant wings on your back. At least with a cape I can make it move around and get out of the way. Wings are sort of locked on. We all know how birds work.

So I go, how do I kind of get wings, angel's wings, on her? Okay. I will put it on a headdress. Why? Because again, there is a whole history of things called *Valkyries* that are there that again,

they are sort of warrior *Vikingesque* sort of girls and they have sort of big headdresses with wings on. It kind of looks cool. And then Spawn has his chains and the chains sort of dance around, again trying to create the illusion of 3-D.

So besides giving her a spear -- Neil said he was surprised I gave her a spear -- because it seems like if you are going to fight each other in war, both sides should have some kind of weaponry; that I didn't want to get her bunkered down with chains, I give her this more elegant look, which is the ribbon, so that again they could sort of dance around on her and have a good thing. So, I mean, I don't know how much further you want to do this. Even her hair being long and flowing sort of can add to the look of 3-D.

Q. Why so scantily clad?

A. A couple obvious reasons. You are going to see a lot of that in the history of women characters when men are at the helm. We usually don't get too conservative with them. I mean, there is a long history of fantasy art that has them -- you know, two of the most famous ones, Frank Frazetta and Boris.

I mean, all the ladies are -- and if you look at Conan and things like that, we just like to add sex.

I wouldn't call it scantily clad. I would go -- we

- 1 like them to be sexy, so we like to show sort of skin.
- 2 And if we don't show skin, I have to tell you, we put
- 3 skin-tight uniforms on them, for the most part.
- 4 So Catwoman having tight leather is no mistake
- 5 and isn't any less sexy because she is covered from
- 6 head to toe, given its body-type uniform. So it's
- 7 | just a standard mechanism that boys have been doing, I
- 8 assume, since the invention of boys.
- 9 Q. Okay. Exhibit 8, Issue 44 of Spawn, do you
- 10 | recognize that issue?
- 11 A. Yeah. It's a Spawn issue, No. 44.
- 12 Q. Okay. And this issue introduces a character
- 13 | called *Tiffany*?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 | Q. Now, did you draw the character *Tiffany*?
- 16 A. In this issue?
- 17 | Q. Yeah.
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. When you look at the images of Tiffany -- I can
- 20 put one up on the screen.
- $21 \parallel A$. Mm-mm. I wrote this issue though.
- 22 | Q. Okay. So let me put Tiffany up. We have Angela
- 23 there as well. I don't know if I can get them both on
- 24 | the same screen or not. Now, both Tiffany and Angela
- 25 have the same markings around the eye?

- 1 A. Yeah, the negative Spawn marking, right, and the
- 2 wide eye.
- $3 \parallel Q$. Okay. And those are features that come from the
- 4 | preexisting Spawn character?
- 5 A. Yeah, the marks on the face and the hollow eyes.
- 6 Q. Okay. And Angela has the spear, but Tiffany has
- 7 | a gun?
- 8 A. Yeah. I think you show it up there, yeah. I
- 9 think she is using a hand-held weapon.
- $10 \parallel Q$. And you are an artist. Is the hair the same on
- 11 | the two characters?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Okay. They are both wearing a bikini-type
- 14 | outfit, correct?
- 15 A. Yeah. I mean, again, the word has been suggested
- 16 scantily or sexy. They are both sexy, yeah.
- 17 | Q. Okay. Tiffany was also described in something
- 18 called the Spawn Bible --
- 19 | A. Okay.
- $20 \parallel Q$. -- do you recall that? Did you happen write any
- 21 of that description of Tiffany?
- 22 A. I don't believe so.
- 23 | Q. You said Angela, you put wings in her headdress?
- 24 | A. Yeah.
- $25 \parallel Q$. All right. So she has a headpiece that has wings

1 on it?

A. Right.

Q. How did you incorporate wings into the Tiffany character?

A. Again, trying to incorporate sort of the obvious choices. When you say "angel," the typical way to give angels wings is just put them on the back and make a lot of feathers. So for her, given that you wanted to make something that's a little sharper and more dangerous and a lot cooler looking is she has got -- they are steel miniwings with sharp blades on them. They are almost like throwing ninja darts, if you will, on her back. I guess if you did a silhouette of her, it would sort of look like wings on the back of her.

- Q. There was a suggestion that one of the toys of Angela actually had wings on her back. Is that just someone missed not being able to see the image properly?
- A. Yeah. Angela never had wings on her, on her back, never had wings on her back.
- Q. To the extent Angela has wings, they are always part of her headpiece?
- 24 A. I believe so.
- 25 Q. Sometimes the hair may be so voluminous that it

somewhat obscures the fact there is a headpiece there?

MR. ARNTSEN: Just object on leading --

THE COURT: Sustained.

MR. ARNTSEN: -- and let it go for a while.

MR. GRIMSLEY: That's fine.

6 BY MR. GRIMSLEY:

- \parallel Q. Did you ever draw -- did you draw the character
- 8 | Domina?

1

2

3

4

5

- 9 A. I don't believe so.
- 10 Q. Okay. Do you recall anything about the
- 11 personality of Domina?
- 12 A. Just an angel out there trying to get the bad
- 13 guys or the good guys, depending on what your
- 14 perspective was of who was the hero in the book.
- 15 Q. Let's go back to Dark Ages Spawn for just a
- 16 | moment.
- 17 | A. Okay.
- $18 \parallel Q$. Did you ask your team to develop any series based
- 19 on the character Medieval Spawn?
- 20 | A. Yeah. I was expanding the Spawn Universe, so I
- 21 wanted to put some more comic books out.
- 22 Q. Okay. And you asked them to develop a series
- 23 | based on Medieval Spawn?
- $24 \parallel A$. No. On Medieval Spawn? No.
- 25 \parallel Q. Okay. Did you direct your team to develop a new

- 1 series based on a particular time period?
- 2 A. You know, my guess is, I probably left it up to
- 3 | them --
- $4 \parallel Q$. Okay.
- 5 A. -- you know, come up with something cool.
- 6 Q. Okay. You don't recall -- do you recall
- 7 directing them to develop something based on a
- 8 | medieval time period?
- 9 A. Not specifically, no.
- 10 MR. GRIMSLEY: Okay. I have nothing further
- 11 at the moment.
- 12 THE COURT: Mr. Arntsen.

CROSS-EXAMINATION

14 | BY MR. ARNTSEN:

- 15 Q. Mr. McFarlane, you and Neil Gaiman cocreated both
- 16 | Angela and Medieval Spawn in Spawn Issue 9, right?
- 17 | A. Yes, sir.
- $18 \parallel Q$. And Angela was the first warrior angel, bounty
- 19 | hunter in the Spawn Universe?
- 20 A. Right.
- 21 | Q. There weren't any angels before Spawn 9, right?
- 22 A. There was a robotic angel in Issue 8, but not a
- 23 | bounty hunter, as you describe it.
- 24 \parallel Q. And in addition to -- in addition to *Spawn* Issue
- 25 9, Mr. Gaiman also wrote a little Angela story in

- 1 | Spawn Issue 26, correct, or a little Angela-related
- 2 story?
- $3 \parallel A$. Yeah, I think he wrote a few pages in that issue,
- 4 correct.
- 5 Q. I will just show you what's been marked Exhibit
- 6 | 4. That's *Spawn* 26, right --
- $7 \parallel A$. Yes, sir.
- 8 Q. -- a couple of pages with Gabrielle and Spawn.
- 9 A. Yeah. Looks like two, maybe three pages, yep.
- 10 Q. And Neil wrote the Angela 1, 2 and 3 comics,
- 11 | correct?
- 12 A. Correct.
- 13 | Q. And at least before she died, Angela was a major
- 14 player in the Spawn Universe, correct?
- $15 \parallel A$. She was one of the characters, one of the
- 16 | supporting cast.
- 17 \parallel Q. Was she a major player in the Spawn Universe?
- 18 A. You could give that definition, yes.
- 19 | Q. What?
- 20 A. You could give that definition, yes.
- 21 Q. And in fact, you referred to her as such,
- 22 | correct?
- 23 A. Okay.
- $24 \parallel Q$. Do you have any questions about that?
- 25 | A. No.

- $1 \parallel Q$. You agree that you referred to her as a major
- 2 player in your comic books?
- $3 \parallel A$. No. I -- if I said it, then I will stand by it,
- 4 | yep.
- $5 \parallel Q$. Let's see Exhibit 7. You recognize that as Spawn
- 6 | 39?
- 7 A. Yes, sir. Do you want me to read that?
- 8 Q. This is, you answered a letter, correct?
- 9 A. Can I look at that for a moment?
- 10 \parallel Q. Sure, sure.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And can you just read the first sentence there?
- 13 A. "Stephanie" -- which is the name of the person
- 14 who wrote the letter -- "Stephanie, Angela is a major
- 15 | player in my comic books, so you will always be seeing
- 16 her on a semi-regular basis. I don't know if I will
- 17 do a book of her, but it's possible, things change."
- 18 Q. That's fine. Thank you. And you don't dispute
- 19 | that you and Neil cocreated Medieval Spawn, correct?
- 20 MR. GRIMSLEY: Asked and answered.
- 21 THE COURT: Overruled.
- 22 \parallel A. What was the question? I'm sorry.
- 23 | Q. You don't dispute that you and Neil cocreated
- 24 | Medieval Spawn, correct?
- 25 A. The character from Issue 9, no, I do not.

- $1 \parallel Q$. Well, and also, there was a comic called Dark
- 2 | Ages Medieval Spawn, correct?
- 3 MR. GRIMSLEY: Object, misstates the
- 4 document.
- 5 A. No, I've never had that.
- 6 Q. Let me show you what's been marked Exhibit 28.
- 7 | A. Okay.
- 8 Q. It says, "Todd Toys Presents: 'Dark Ages'
- 9 | medieval Spawn, correct?
- 10 A. Let's just get some clarity here. The title of
- 11 | that book is called Spawn --
- 12 | Q. Right.
- 13 A. -- and the character is called medieval Spawn.
- 14 Q. And it says, "Todd Toys Presents: 'Dark Ages'"?
- 15 A. Right, right. It's a title on the inside, right.
- 16 Q. And "Medieval Spawn created by: Todd Mcfarlane &
- 17 | Neil Gaiman, correct?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 || Q. And that was 800 years ago, right?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 | Q. And you are familiar with the concept of
- 22 derivative characters, aren't you?
- 23 A. In a general sense. Again, I'm not a lawyer
- 24 | either, so --
- 25 | Q. But, for instance, Medieval Spawn is a derivative

- 1 that he connected the two in that issue.
- 2 MR. GRIMSLEY: And he did not establish
- 3 the -- it's sustained.
- 4 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 5 Q. Showing you what's been marked Exhibit 21, can
- 6 | you identify that?
- $7 \parallel A$. It looks like it's Issue 22 of another series
- 8 | called Curse of the Spawn. It is a separate comic
- 9 book series.
- 10 Q. Another one of your Spawn series?
- 11 A. Another Spawn series, that's right.
- 12 MR. GRIMSLEY: I'm sorry. Which exhibit are
- 13 we looking at?
- 14 MR. ARNTSEN: 21.
- 15 MR. GRIMSLEY: Thank you.
- 16 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 17 || Q. And you see there is what's called an *End Cap*?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 $\|$ Q. What are the End Caps, generally?
- 20 A. I think in some of the comic books, the End Caps
- 21 were advertisements from the toy company that put some
- 22 of the toys in there, that put pictures and
- 23 descriptions.
- $24 \parallel Q$. When you say "the toy company," that's your toy
- 25 | company, correct?

- 1 A. Yeah. It's a separate company from the comic
- 2 book company, yeah.
- $3 \parallel \mathsf{Q}$. And this here talks about "The Dark Ages Come To
- 4 | Light, " correct?
- 5 A. I haven't seen this, so let me read it. Do you
- 6 want me to read that or --
- 7 Q. No. That End Cap refers to "The Dark Ages,"
- 8 | correct?
- 9 A. That sentence right there?
- 10 | Q. Yeah.
- 11 A. Yeah. I mean, I didn't write that stuff.
- 12 Q. And then the following paragraph, it talks about
- 13 | "Spawn Series 11 has an emphasis on this medieval
- 14 | time, correct?
- 15 \parallel A. Let me see it.
- MR. GRIMSLEY: Relevance, Your Honor, to this
- 17 continuing line of questioning, since he has already
- 18 | testified he didn't write this thing that he is being
- 19 | questioned about.
- 20 | THE COURT: Why would it be relevant if he
- 21 | didn't write it?
- 22 MR. ARNTSEN: Because it's his comic company.
- 23 I can ask.
- 24 | BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 25 Q. It's your toy company, correct?

- A. The toy company that put these toys out?
- 2 | Q. Yeah.
- $3 \parallel A$. Yes, sir.
- 4 MR. GRIMSLEY: Which is not a party here
- 5 | today.

- 6 THE COURT: Well, what's your relationship
- 7 with the toy company?
- 8 THE WITNESS: I own it.
- 9 THE COURT: I will overrule the objection.
- 10 THE WITNESS: Okay. Is there a question?
- 11 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 12 Q. It's really fairly straightforward --
- 13 A. Okay.
- 14 | Q. -- the title refers to "The Dark Ages," correct?
- 15 A. "The Dark Ages Come To Light," yeah.
- 16 \parallel Q. And then the first paragraph refers again to "the
- 17 | Dark Ages, correct?
- 18 | A. Yes, sir.
- 19 Q. And then the second paragraph refers to "this
- 20 | medieval time, correct, the first sentence of the
- 21 second paragraph?
- 22 A. Yes, sir.
- 23 | Q. And part of the Spawn myth was that a Hellspawn
- 24 occurred every 400 years, correct?
- 25 \parallel A. There may have been a time when that was true.

- Q. Was there a time when that was true?
- $2 \parallel A$. It's possible, yes.
- 3 MR. ARNTSEN: Excuse me a second. Exhibit
- 4 | 20.

- 5 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 6 Q. Showing you what's been marked Exhibit 20, can
- 7 you identify what that is?
- 8 A. Yeah. It's Issue No. 4 of another comic series
- 9 called Curse of the Spawn.
- $10 \parallel Q$. And then you see there is a section in the back
- 11 | called Curse Words?
- 12 A. That's the title of the letter page, correct.
- 13 Q. And I'm showing your attention here, do you see
- 14 where it says there, "A new Spawn appears on earth
- 15 | every 400 years?"
- 16 A. Could I take time to read this?
- 17 Q. Yes. Yes, you may.
- 18 A. Okay.
- 19 Q. Mr. McFarlane, did I read that correctly?
- 20 A. It looks like it's an answer from Alan Moore.
- 21 Q. It was a letter to you, correct?
- 22 A. To Curse Words, right. "Dear Alan" -- the letter
- 23 | is to Allen Moore -- it says, "Dear Alan."
- 24 | Q. Right. And then it says, "Since this is
- 25 | addressed to Alan and I feel he can answer your

- 1 questions better than I can. This is you answering
- 2 | that, correct?
- $3 \parallel A$. Right. Somebody wrote a letter to Alan and so I
- 4 said, you are writing a letter to Alan. I think Alan
- 5 can answer it better than I can.
- 6 Q. Right. And the answer is, "A new Spawn appears
- 7 on the earth every 400 years, correct?
- 8 A. Right, and that was Alan's answer, correct.
- 9 Q. All right. Thank you.
- 10 THE COURT: I think we will take a 15-minute
- 11 recess at this point.
- 12 MR. ARNTSEN: That's fine, Your Honor.
- 13 THE COURT: Are you calling any other
- 14 | witnesses besides Mr. McFarlane?
- 15 MR. GRIMSLEY: No, Your Honor, we are not.
- 16 THE COURT: Okay. All right. We will recess
- 17 | for 15 minutes.
- 18 (Recess at 2:41 p.m. until 2:55 p.m.)
- 19 THE COURT: Mr. Arntsen.
- 20 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- 21 | Q. Mr. McFarlane, the Spawn Universe is an important
- 22 | thing to you, correct?
- 23 A. Spawn mythology, the original Spawn mythology,
- 24 | right.
- 25 | Q. And you were here when Mr. Holguin testified

- 1 earlier in connection with you talking with him, in
- 2 | terms of the Spawn Dark Ages series, just to make sure
- 3 how it fit into the mythology, correct?
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 Q. And so in addition to the original Spawn series,
- 6 there was, for instance, Spawn Dark Ages, which was
- 7 set 800 years ago, right?
- 8 A. I don't know if they established that. I don't
- 9 recall.
- 10 $\|$ Q. It was set -- it was set in the past?
- 11 \parallel A. In the past; yes, sir.
- 12 Q. And as you testified here today, you are now
- 13 willing to acknowledge that it was set 800 years ago?
- 14 | A. I can --
- 15 MR. GRIMSLEY: Asked and answered.
- 16 THE WITNESS: Whoops.
- 17 MR. GRIMSLEY: Asked and answered. I'm
- 18 sorry.
- 19 THE COURT: Sustained.
- 20 BY MR. ARNTSEN:
- $21 \parallel Q$. And then another comic series is Curse of the
- 22 | Spawn, correct?
- 23 A. Yes, sir.
- 24 | Q. And that's set in the future, right?
- $25 \parallel A$. I don't think so.

- 1 | Q. I'm showing you what again has been marked
- 2 Exhibit 20. And we were referring you to a letter and
- 3 then you referred that letter to Alan McElroy, who was
- 4 | the writer, correct?
- 5 A. Right. I think I may have misspoke. I think I
- 6 might have said Alan Moore.
- 7 Q. Right. You meant Alan McElroy, correct?
- $8 \parallel A$. Yes, sir.
- 9 Q. And again, what he says, the passage -- first of
- 10 | all, the protagonist of the Curse of the Spawn is
- 11 | named Daniel Llanso, correct?
- 12 A. Can I read them?
- 13 Q. You may.
- 14 A. In this particular issue.
- 15 Q. Daniel Llanso is the Spawn, correct?
- 16 A. In that particular issue. I don't mean to
- 17 correct you here, but Curse of the Spawn I think was a
- 18 | variation of a bunch of different stories throughout
- 19 | the run. It wasn't one set of characters; it was a
- 20 different episode, if you will.
- 21 | Q. But Curse of the Spawn 4 involved a Spawn named
- 22 | Daniel Llanso, correct?
- 23 A. That's what it looks like; yes, sir.
- $24 \parallel Q$. And then in the letter we referred to here with
- 25 | Mr. McElroy, who is the writer, he says, "A new Spawn

- 1 appears on earth every 400 years and Daniel Llanso is
- 2 the Spawn that shows up 400 years after Al Simmons,"
- 3 correct?
- $4 \parallel A$. That's what we wrote. We weren't terribly
- 5 consistent with it and it wasn't a rule.
- 6 Q. But here, when he is talking about Al Simmons, he
- 7 | says his story happened 400 years in the past,
- 8 | correct?
- 9 A. Right, but we weren't consistent with that and it
- 10 wasn't a rule.
- 11 | Q. Mr. McFarlane, I will show you what's been marked
- 12 Exhibit 26. And do you recognize this as Volume 15 of
- 13 | Spawn Dark Ages?
- $14 \parallel A$. Yes, sir.
- 15 | Q. Turning to a page here, it says, "It was a 400
- 16 year gamble laid down by players who had no intention
- 17 \parallel of losing." Do you know what that's referring to?
- 18 A. No. I didn't write that issue.
- 19 Q. Isn't that referring to the fact that Hellspawn
- 20 can only appear once every 400 years?
- 21 A. I didn't write the issue. It's possible. What
- 22 | issue was that?
- 23 Q. 15.
- $24 \parallel A$. 15. Okay. Who -- I guess I don't get to ask
- 25 | questions.

TODD MCFARLANE - REDIRECT

the costume, so there is an inconsistency just in the

24

25

process itself.

And the other one that, you know, sort of applies here on another level is just marketing. As Spawn became one issue and then he had more books and then eventually I made some toys and then people came and wanted to put him on TV and make a video game, the way that you sort of thought that you might have wanted to do something at the beginning isn't necessarily how you get there. So we all have ideas at the beginning of what we want, but you break those rules to sort of suit the needs of the wants of the fans and the marketing you end up doing.

Q. And the exhibits on Dark Ages will show what they

- Q. And the exhibits on Dark Ages will show what they show and we can direct the Court to the proper places in subsequent briefing or however else. But would it surprise you to see that The Dark Ages series, say, begins in one century and then goes forward a couple of centuries, then scoots backwards as far as 900 AD; would that surprise you?
- \parallel A. Not really.

- 20 MR. GRIMSLEY: No further questions.
- 21 | THE COURT: Mr. Arntsen, anything else?
- 22 MR. ARNTSEN: That's all I have.
- 23 THE COURT: You may step down.
- 24 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 25 THE COURT: Anything else you want to put in

today?

THE WITNESS: Could I leave these here?

THE COURT: Just leave them here.

MR. ARNTSEN: Again, I think we have got an agreement on the mechanics for exhibits.

MR. GRIMSLEY: Right, I think we do have an agreement. There was one of the toys that was not previously marked that we are going to add to the end with an exhibit list, assuming you don't want the physical items in the box. We had discussed substituting a photograph of the toy to submit to you as the exhibits.

THE COURT: All right.

MR. ARNTSEN: What we thought we would get you, Your Honor, is a set of each of the exhibits, a color copy of each of the comics, and give that to you. Would you like that or would you like the original comics separately? We thought we would give you a binder that just had tabs with color copies of everything.

THE COURT: Well, if the writing is legible, the color would help a lot.

MR. ARNTSEN: There will be the color.

THE COURT: You know, otherwise it just looks like a lot of lines. Just for the record, I want to

```
say that I show that 4 and 5 were never moved or never
1
 2
   talked about. I want to be sure this jives with your
 3
   recollection.
 4
            MR. ARNTSEN: No, I did talk about Exhibit 4.
 5
   That was Spawn 26. We talked about it kind of right
 6
   at the end with Mr. McFarlane.
7
             THE COURT: Okay.
            MR. ARNTSEN: 5 was not talked about. Also,
8
9
   from my list, I believe 15 wasn't talked about.
10
             THE COURT: And I don't show anything about
   7. Do you show something for 7?
11
12
            MR. ARNTSEN: I think right at the end, Spawn
13
   39, I believe I did.
14
            THE COURT: I'm talking about exhibits
   though.
15
16
            MR. ARNTSEN: Yeah, Exhibit 7. Yes, that was
17
   what had the quote of Angela being a major player in
18
   the comic books right toward the end of his
19
   examination.
20
             THE COURT: What exactly is the exhibit?
21
            MR. ARNTSEN: It is Spawn 39.
22
             THE COURT: Okay. And that was
   Mr. McFarlane?
23
24
            MR. ARNTSEN: Yes.
```

MR. GRIMSLEY: There were several of the

books, I don't have any problem.

THE COURT: What is 45?

MR. LEVIN: What is 45?

MR. GRIMSLEY: 45 is Spawn Dark Ages 36.

23

24

```
Case: 3:02-cv-00048-bbc Document #: 313 Filed: 06/18/10 Page 83 of 86
             THE COURT: And 46?
 1
 2
            MR. GRIMSLEY: Is Spawn Dark Ages Issue 7.
 3
             THE COURT: Okay. Did you want to do
   additional briefing?
 4
 5
            MR. GRIMSLEY: If Your Honor thought it would
 6
   be helpful, I think something short.
 7
             THE COURT: Very short.
            MR. GRIMSLEY: You know, drawing on the
 8
 9
   transcript of today.
10
            MR. ARNTSEN: Mr. Simmons is doing -- Jeff,
   what do you think you are doing, the closing?
11
12
             MR. SIMMONS: It's up to the Court whether it
   thinks it would be helpful or not. I don't know that
13
14
   there are a lot of legal issues that need to be
   briefed. I think this is mainly factual issues.
15
16
   facts are in the record. In closing, we can
   rehighlight the facts if you think that would be
17
18
   helpful.
19
             THE COURT: Something in by a week from
20
   Friday, each of you. Do you want to do it
21
   concurrently or consecutively?
22
            MR. SIMMONS: Concurrently.
23
            MR. GRIMSLEY: I'm happy to do it
24
   concurrently.
```

MR. SIMMONS: Concurrently, yeah, makes

this afternoon and leave whatever you want me to look

```
1
   at?
 2
           MR. ARNTSEN: What we thought we would do is
   put together a set of exhibits that we would get to
 3
   you that we would put them together. We would get
 4
 5
   them to you by whenever you wanted them by.
 6
            THE COURT: Next Friday is fine.
 7
           MR. ARNTSEN: So the briefs -- you will get
   the briefs and you will get a set of the exhibits.
8
 9
            THE COURT: Okay.
                             That's fine.
10
           MR. ARNTSEN: You will get a package.
11
            THE COURT: Very good.
12
           MR. GRIMSLEY:
                          Thank you.
           THE COURT: Court will adjourn.
13
14
        (Adjourned at 3:09 p.m.)
                            * * *
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	I, CHERYL A. SEEMAN, Certified Realtime and
2	Merit Reporter, in and for the State of Wisconsin,
3	certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate
4	record of the proceedings held on the 14th day of
5	June, 2010, before the Honorable Barbara B. Crabb of
6	the Western District of Wisconsin, in my presence and
7	reduced to writing in accordance with my stenographic
8	notes made at said time and place.
9	Dated this 18th day of June, 2010.
0	
1	

/s/

Cheryl A. Seeman, RMR, CRR Federal Court Reporter

The foregoing certification of this transcript does not apply to any reproduction of the same by any means unless under the direct control and/or direction of the certifying reporter.